

# Interaction between Hosts and Guests : E. M. Forster's Representation of Modern Tourism in Where Angels Fear to Tread and "The Eternal Moment"

Otani, Erika

Graduate School of Humanities, Kyushu University : Doctoral Program

<https://doi.org/10.15017/1560536>

---

出版情報 : 九大英文学. 57, pp.1-19, 2015-03-31. The Society of English Literature and Linguistics, Kyushu University

バージョン :

権利関係 :

Interaction between Hosts and Guests:  
E. M. Forster's Representation of Modern Tourism in  
*Where Angels Fear to Tread* and "The Eternal Moment"

Erika Otani

## **Introduction**

Audrey Lavin points out that E. M. Forster's two "deceptively simple" Italian novels (*Where Angels Fear to Tread* and *A Room with a View*) have been all but neglected because they have been considered inappropriate as subjects of literary inquiry (14). As Nicholas Royle suggests, however, there has been a significant shift in the context of reading Forster's work since the posthumous publication of his homosexual novel, *Maurice* (1971) (6). Recent criticism of Forster's works has been related to Forster's homosexual dimensions and various other issues such as feminism, gender, Orientalism and national identity. James Buzard criticizes Forster's texts focusing on tourism, and his sharp-eyed criticism made me realize that Forster's treatment of modern tourism should be studied further by employing interdisciplinary approaches in tourism studies that have been developed in a variety of fields such as sociology and anthropology.

*Where Angels Fear to Tread* (1905) is not a novel about tourism, but one about a culture clash based on the struggles for ownership of an infant. However, this novel can be read as a tragicomic tale that resulted from the difference between the touristic Italy that the protagonists see during their trip and the real Italy. The objective of this essay is to reveal how Forster depicts the interaction between tourists and host communities. To do so, first, I focus attention on Philip's touristic experiences and his liberating process in *Where Angels Fear to Tread*. In addition to this, I discuss the symbols of Lilia in this novel. Second, I analyze "The Eternal Moment" to discuss the impact of modern tourism on a tourist destination. And

finally, I discuss the reason why Forster was able to create a character like Gino in *Where Angels Fear to Tread*.

## 1. Philip's First and Second Italian Experiences

In *Where Angels Fear to Tread*, Philip Herriton and Miss Abbott are the main protagonists, but Philip is more important than Miss Abbott because Forster says that the point of *Where Angels Fear to Tread* is “the improvement of Philip” (Lago 31). As many critics suggest, the character of Philip is obviously a wry self-portrait; even Forster himself admits it.<sup>1</sup> This novel consists of 10 chapters. Philip visits Italy to rescue Lilia in Chapter 2, and the rescue party, including Philip, goes to Italy to bring back Lilia and Gino's baby, from Chapter 6 to Chapter 10. We are told that Philip already made a trip to Italy a few years ago in Chapter 5. In short, Philip visits Italy three times in this novel. From these trips, Forster creates different types of travel experiences. In this section, I would like to examine Philip's first trip to Italy, and also interpret the meaning of his disillusionment during his second Italian trip.

The precise portraits of Philip are provided in chapter 5 of this novel. He is a young and tall, yet physically weak, lawyer. We notice from these descriptions that he is far from being handsome; or, to put it another way, he does not possess any physical attraction. However, he has two special talents: a sense of beauty and a sense of humor. Italy first developed his sense of beauty.

At twenty-two he went to Italy with some cousins, and there he absorbed into one aesthetic whole olive-trees, blue sky, frescoes, country inns, saints, peasants, mosaics, statues, beggars. He came back with the air of a prophet who would either remodel Sawston or reject it.

All the energies and enthusiasms of a rather friendless life had passed

---

<sup>1</sup> Wilfred Stone quotes Forster's interview as follows: “When Forster was asked, ‘Do any of your characters represent yourself at all?’ he replied, ‘Rickie more than any. Also Philip. And Cecil (in *A Room with a View*) has got something of Philip in him’” (qtd in Stone, 176).

into the championship of beauty. (*Where Angels Fear to Tread* 51)

Yet, Philip concluded that he could not reform Sawston, not knowing that "human love and love of truth sometimes conquer where love of beauty fails" (52). He resumed his prosaic life at Sawston, relying on his sense of humor. He laughs at everything to keep his intellectual superiority and to protect himself. In this respect, Philip resembles Cecil in *A Room with a View*. Like in Cecil's case,<sup>2</sup> Italy did not humanize Philip; what is more, Italy might have reinforced his aestheticism and snobbishness. His behavior is related to his personal problem, which is his tendency to see all life as a spectacle. I will later examine his defects.

His sense of humor led Philip to come up with the idea of vulgar Lilia journeying to Italy, which he loves and reveres; this is the reason why Philip counsels Lilia to go off the main track and love Italians, as if he knew all of Italy. All the troubles in this novel resulted from Philip's anti-touristic advice. Though he ridicules Lilia's ignorance and her false taste in art, he says, "I do believe that Italy really purifies and ennobles all who visit her. She is the school as well as the playground of the world" (6). Lilia's letters from Monteriano make Philip really happy at first because Lilia writes to him: "In a place like this, . . . one really does feel in the heart of things, and off the beaten track" (8), or the next time, she writes: "We love this place, and I do not know how I shall ever thank Philip for telling me it. It is not only so quaint, but one sees the Italians unspoiled in all their simplicity and charm here" (9). Lilia, however, soon brings about things that even Philip cannot laugh at. The letter from Lilia's mother was to announce Lilia's engagement to an Italian man. Even though Philip thinks that he understands and loves Italian people, unlike a typical tourist, he completely changes his attitude when he faces difficulties in accepting the Italian Gino as a brother-in-law.

Mrs. Herriton dispatches Philip to Italy in order to break off the match. This is the second visit to Italy for Philip. In Monteriano, when he learns that Gino is not a

---

<sup>2</sup> For further details of Cecil's Italian experience, see Otani.

member of the old Italian nobility, but the son of a dentist in a provincial town, he gives a cry as follows:

A dentist! A dentist at Monteriano! A dentist in fairyland! False teeth and laughing-gas and the tilting chair at a place which knew the Etruscan League, and the Pax Romana, and Alaric himself, and the Countess Matilda, and the Middle Ages, and holiness, and the Renaissance, all fighting and beauty! He thought of Lilia no longer. He was anxious for himself: he feared that Romance might die. (20)

Philip's disillusionment can be variously interpreted. When Philip dines with Gino, Lilia and Miss Abbott at the hotel in Monteriano, he watches the way Gino ate spaghetti and looks at his face. Philip thinks:

And Philip had seen that face before in Italy a hundred times – seen it and loved it, for it was not merely beautiful, but had the charm which is the rightful heritage of all who are born on that soil. But he did not want to see it opposite him at dinner. It was not the face of a gentleman. (23)

This extract shows us Philip's contradictory emotions. Wilfred Stone observes that "[h]is [Gino's] existence is profoundly disturbing to Philip, who has fallen in love with a Baedeker Italy but fears the unmediated reality that Gino represents" (165). It is symbolically suggestive. Unlike Miss Lavish's anti-guidebook ideas in *A Room with a View*, Philip is a person who detects the hidden charms of Baedeker.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup> In Lavin's view, the roles of Baedeker in *Where Angels Fear to Tread* are different from the one in *A Room with a View*. Lavin remarks that "the individual's reaction to the Prose-cum-poetry of the *Baedeker*" is important (54). For example, when Mrs. Herriton read Baedeker's description of Monteriano, she thinks that some of the information seems unnecessary, and all of it is uninteresting. In contrast, the narrator of this novel adds that "Philip could never read 'The view from the Rocca (small gratuity) is finest at sunset' without a catching at the heart" (13). Their reaction toward Baedeker shows that sensitive Philip finds "poetry in the travel guide's descriptive prose" (Lavin 58), whereas Mrs. Herriton has no imagination.

Buzard takes a closer look at Philip's disillusionment:

For all that he [Philip] figures himself a 'traveller' in touch with the people, not just the tourist attractions, of his favoured land, Philip clings to a shop-worn set of stereotypes about the Italians, whom he prefers to imagine in romantic and picturesque postures rather than in prosaic modern circumstances. (310)

Buzard clearly penetrates Philip's ambiguous touristic experience, for Philip's first Italian experience was also superficial like so many other tourists, though Philip did not regard himself as a typical tourist. I think that Philip's disillusionment may suggest not only his bookish appreciation of Italy but also the limitations of anti-tourist's (or tourist's) recognition of other cultures.

John Urry explains the role that the consumption of visual images plays in contemporary leisure and tourism, by using his concept of the "tourist gaze." Urry notes:

Places are chosen to be gazed upon because there is an anticipation, especially through daydreaming and fantasy, of intense pleasures, either on a different scale or involving different senses from those customarily encountered. Such anticipation is constructed and sustained through a variety of non-tourist practices, such as film, TV, literature, magazines, records and videos, which construct and reinforce that gaze. (3)

Though Philip's first Italian experience is related as an episode in Chapter 5, we can say that he just read the landscape of Italy and Italian people as signifiers of certain well-established stereotypes or signs derived from various previous texts. Even though he thought that he had seen the real Italy on his previous trip, he just enjoyed the conventional, approved sights of Italy. That is why the episode of his first trip is just a collection of existing labels—"olive-trees, blue sky, frescoes, country inns,

saints, peasants, mosaics, statues, beggars.” He returned from his first experience of Italy with a romantic and picturesque picture of the country; hence he idealized Italy too much. He only sees paradisiacal and beautiful aspects of Italy before he meets and gets to know Gino.

However, the existence of Gino now shows him the reality of Italy. This disillusionment through his second Italian experience leads Philip to revise his aesthetic and idealistic picture of Italy, and then he has a chance to join the “prosaic modern circumstances” of the real Italy. Philip returns to Sawston disenchanted.

Though Forster tends to idealize and romanticize Italy in *A Room with a View*, he depicts Italy as a land that represents both good and evil in this novel. One of the evil sides of Italy is fully expressed in Lilia’s miserable married life with Gino in Italy.

## **2. Lilia and Gino**

Before Lilia won a year of freedom in Italy, she was cooped up in Sawston under the supervision of Mrs. Herriton. When Philip is dispatched to Italy to rescue Lilia, Lilia expresses her true feelings regarding Sawston’s suffocating life: “For twelve years you’ve trained me and tortured me, and I’ll stand it no more. . . . But, thank goodness, I can stand up against the world now, for I’ve found Gino, and this time I marry for love!” (26-27). Lilia’s confession shows us that she, like Lucy in *A Room with a View*, chose Gino to transform her life based on freedom, happiness and true love. Lilia, however, soon becomes more miserable than she was in Sawston because she discovers Monteriano is not a dreamland but a male-dominated provincial society.

After Gino tolerates Lilia’s foreign ways and privileges such as English tea-parties and her solitary walks for a little while, Gino finally realizes for the first time the responsibilities of married life. Therefore he becomes a normal Italian husband, refusing to bring people to the house and prohibiting her from walking alone.

Lilia becomes unhappy day by day because Gino always leaves her alone.

What is worse, Lilia finally realizes that Gino got married to her for money. At the same time, she discovers his infidelity by accident, which she is totally devastated by. By this time, Gino makes her do what he wants. In contrast, Lilia sees Gino as "a cruel, worthless, hypocritical, dissolute upstart" (48). Lilia regards her present condition as captivity, comparing with her old Sawston life:

She had given up everything for him—her daughter, her relatives, her friends, all the little comforts and luxuries of a civilized life—and even if she had the courage to break away there was no one who would receive her now. (45-46)

Even though she hated Sawston so much, she now regards her previous life in Sawston as follows: "It seemed impossible that such a free, happy life could exist" (46).

Lilia dies giving birth to a baby son at the end of chapter 4 of this novel. Before that, the narrator cynically summarizes the tragedy of Lilia's married life that resulted from the culture clash between Lilia and Gino: "No one realized that more than personalities were engaged; that the struggle was national; that generations of ancestors, good, bad or indifferent, forbade the Latin man to be chivalrous to the northern woman, northern woman to forgive the Latin man" (49). And, we are told, "Mrs. Herriton foresaw it from the first" (49).

According to John Pemble, intermarriage between Italians and middle class British people seems to have been rare in the Victorian and Edwardian era except for servants (262). Elizabeth Browning wrote the following sentence from Florence in 1848: "Here it is by no means an uncommon thing for English ladies' maids to marry Italians and settle happily" (qtd. in Pemble, 262). Pemble, however, implies that Anglo-Italian marriages tend to be not a result of understanding and sympathy but generally business transactions, quoting the word of Antonio Gallenga who knows well of both nationalities. Then, Pemble says that Forster is "the only novelist of any stature" to attempt a fictional treatment of these Anglo-Italian marriages



(263). It is well known that this novel originated in an overheard hotel conversation about “an English lady who had married an Italian far beneath her socially” during Forster’s Italian tour (Colmer 27). And it is also well known that Forster was not familiar with Italian society even though he depicted Italian male-dominated society in this work. Lilia might be an innocent victim in this novel. Lilia’s marriage with Gino leads Philip to come to know the real Italy, and Lilia’s death compels him to confront a real Italian man. What is more, Lilia’s married life teaches us the difference between romantic appearances (the tourist Italy) and reality (the real Italy).

But, seen from a different perspective, this irregular marriage may represent Forster’s sense of the cultural superiority of English people. Although he uses Italy to criticize British middle-class values, he is sometimes complicit with English society’s values. For example, even Lilia feels “unexpected terror” when she imagines that Irma (her child in Sawston) or any English child would be educated in Monteriano (33). Lilia definitely assumes the cultural superiority of English people. In addition, the narrator of this novel suggests that if Lilia had been different, “he [Gino] might possibly – though not probably – have been made a better husband as well as a better man, and at all events he could have adopted the attitude of the Englishman, whose standard is higher even when his practice is the same” (45). The narrator admits that the attitude of the Englishman is higher than that of the Latin.<sup>4</sup> And although Lilia’s rebellion may arouse sympathetic echoes in readers because Sawston is such a closed society, the narrator says, “But had Lilia been different she might not have married him” (45). The narrator in this way makes sarcastic remarks about Lilia’s character. Miss Abbott’s opinion about Lilia’s tragedy will give us an accurate truth: “She [Lilia] only changed one groove for another – a worse groove” (57). “A worse groove” means Italian society.

---

<sup>4</sup> Randall Stevenson also interprets this passage as Forster’s complicity with the values of English society, saying that “*Where Angels Fear to Tread* suggests that the English may have much to learn from Italy, yet readily stereotypes the ‘morality. . .of the average Latin’, contrasting it with ‘the Englishman, whose standard is higher’” (219).

Frederic Crews suggests that "Lilia's death in child birth, and the later death of her baby during Harriet's kidnapping, are palpable symbols of the danger of thinking that the two opposite cultures can be easily reconciled" (74). Crews's interpretation is one way to read the symbols of both deaths. Yet, I suppose that the death of Lilia suggests that the person who deviates from English social structure (in other words, the person who becomes an outsider) can be miserable. Though Italy teaches Forster's characters the passion necessary for a complete life in his novels, Italy is not a place to live but a place to learn love and passion. In this respect, I agree with Paul Peplis in thinking that "if the first half of *Where Angels Fear to Tread* works as a parable about the dangers of an overly naïve attempt to escape nationality, the later chapters insist that encounters with otherness can be transfiguring, particularly if unplanned or violent" (50). It is true that Forster's characters in this novel do not meet the *genius loci*, but they meet Gino who represents Italian good-and-evil power. To respond to Gino is a key that leads Philip to understand passion or love after the death of Lilia.

### **3. Philip's Third Journey to Italy**

In chapter 5 of this novel, Miss Abbott decides to rescue Lilia and Gino's heir because she thinks that "[t]he child came into the world through my negligence" (62). Miss Abbott's attitude leads Mrs. Herriton to decide to send her son, Philip and her daughter, Harriet, to Monteriano in order to rescue the baby from the horrible man, Gino, and an uncivilized life.

Philip's third trip to Italy to rescue the baby shows us his spiritual transfiguration just as Lucy in *A Room with a View* is re-created by Italy. This time, the rescue party consists of Philip, Harriet, and Miss Abbott. In Monteriano, Philip's education advances through several events such as the delightful local opera scene, the conversation between Philip and Miss Abbott, and Philip's confrontation with Gino caused by the death of the child. I would like to narrow my focus to two scenes: the delightful scene of the local opera and the horrible scene of the death of the child and the fight between Gino and Philip.

The scene of the local opera is the most delightful in this novel. Though they come to Italy as emissaries of civilization, not as tourists, they decide to go to the opera (*Lucia di Lammermoor*). Philip explains the principle of opera in Italy: “it aims not at illusion but at entertainment” (87). Though Harriet makes the audience quiet once and turns “this great evening party into a prayer meeting” (87), Harriet’s power is soon over. Philip and Miss Abbott rejoice in the carnival atmosphere within the little local theatre.

So the opera proceeded. The singers drew inspiration from the audience, and the two great sextets were rendered not unworthily. Miss Abbott fell into the spirit of the thing. She, too, chatted and laughed and applauded and encored, and rejoiced in the existence of beauty. As for Philip, he forgot himself as well as his mission. He was not even an enthusiastic visitor. (88)

In this cheerful mood, Philip meets Gino, and Gino welcomes Philip. In this scene, a Turnerian “*communitas*” definitely emerges. The warm Italian holiday spirit of this scene reminds me of the scene of the Hindu ceremony in *A Passage to India* in which people reveal their human nature by transcending class, age and sex. Victor Turner writes about *communitas* as follows: “It becomes visible in tribal rites of passage, in millenarian movements, in monasteries, in the counterculture, and on countless informal occasions” (231). I think that Forster tends to be fascinated with the moment in which social structure is liberated and human difference seems to fade into a sense of comradeship.

Before turning to the horrible scene, we must draw attention to the conversation between Miss Abbott and Philip. When Miss Abbott realizes that Gino loves his baby in his house, she feels that “[t]he horrible truth, that wicked people are capable of love, stood naked before her, and her moral being was abashed” (100). In the Church of Santa Deodata, Miss Abbott criticizes Philip’s ambivalent attitude, saying, “You appreciate us all – see good in all of us” and “all the time you are dead

– dead—dead” (110). And she also says, “You are so splendid, Mr Herriton, that I can’t bear to see you wasted. I can’t bear – she has not been good to you – your mother” (110). Here, she points out that Philip is Mrs Herriton’s slave. Then, Philip replies as follows:

“Some people are born not to do things. I’m one of them; . . . I seem fated to pass through the world without colliding with it or moving it – and I’m sure I can’t tell you whether the fate’s good or evil. I don’t die – I don’t fall in love. And if other people die or fall in love they always do it when I’m not there. You are quite right: life to me is just a spectacle, which – thank God, and thank Italy, and thank you – is now more beautiful and heartening than it has ever been before.” (110)

After Miss Abbott hears Philip’s explanation, she says solemnly, “I wish something would happen to you, my dear friend; I wish something would happen to you” (110). We notice here, from their conversation, Philip cannot cope with life in the raw like Cecil. He is an observer of life and he also tends to turn life into art like Cecil. His tendency to see all of life as a spectacle is the primary defect in his character. So, Forster’s project in chapter 9 of this novel is to show how Philip comes in contact with life or participates in life. To do so, Forster sets up the most violent event, in which Philip is compelled to confront Gino.

Though Philip fails to purchase the baby from Gino, Harriet resorts to kidnapping. But, the child is killed in a carriage accident. Philip breaks an arm in this accident. This tragic accident leads Philip to go alone to inform Gino of his son’s death. After Gino hears the news from Philip, he violently attacks him. This violent fight between Gino and Philip is stopped by Miss Abbott, and she brings about a reconciliation between Gino and Philip. Through this painful and crucial education, Philip undergoes conversion, and he is saved with the help of the goddess Miss Abbott. Buzard reads this violent scene as follows: “a dark parody of the anti-tourist’s goal, ‘true contact’ with the alien – the grief-stricken Gino beats him

nearly to death” (312). Something does happen to Philip through this painful education even though he used to think that nothing happens to him.

The novel concludes with their train journey to return to England. Surprisingly, while Philip is gradually charmed by strange mysterious Italy and Gino through his third Italian experience, he is also charmed by Miss Abbott. On the train, however, Caroline confesses her love for Gino, so Philip loses her. As Lionel Trilling points out, “his salvation cannot be complete” (66). It is true that he may still be an observer of life, but we readers understand Philip’s progress.

From a different standpoint, Ardis argues that “Philip’s classical education and intellectuality are a handicap rather than an asset to him in understanding what has transpired in Italy” (73). And she also says that the reason why Lucy and George in *A Room with a View* can respond honestly to the true self is that they have never had such classical intellectual education like public school (Ardis 73). This is very suggestive; Cecil and Philip have been formed by classical educations so that they cannot cope with life in the raw.

#### **4. Miss Raby’s Novel and Vorta’s Transformation**

In this section, we will mainly discuss how modern tourism affects local people, by citing instances mainly from one of Forster’s famous short stories, “The Eternal Moment.” The impact of tourism on the host community or society is also an important theoretical focus within the sociology and anthropology of tourism in recent years. As we have already seen in *Where Angels Fear to Tread*, Forster usually uses foreign travel (tourism) as a way of liberating his English characters from old conventions. In short, Italy affects and changes his characters. By contrast, in “The Eternal Moment,” Forster also wrote how his character (a novelist) or tourism industries affect a host country where local people accept tourists.

“The Eternal Moment” is set in an Italian Alpine town, called Vorta. Cortina d’Ampezzo is a model for Vorta. The protagonist of this story is a middle-aged novelist, Miss Raby. After many years’ absence, Miss Raby returns to Vorta where, in her youth, she had a trivial love adventure with a poor, young Italian porter. This

incident became her gratifying memory. And then she used this place as a setting for her first novel, called 'The Eternal Moment' which soon made her reputation as well as the reputation of Vorta. But, when Miss Raby returns to this place now, she discovers that rural, pastoral Vorta became a tourist mecca. So, she immediately thinks that her book spoiled this place and made the inhabitants corrupt and sordid. Therefore, she feels that she is to blame. She also finds that the porter (Feo), who declared his love for her twenty years ago, has become the fat concierge of a new luxurious hotel, the *Grand Hotel des Alpes*. Miss Raby thinks that he is now a modern, ugly middle-class vulgarian. She also feels that he is corrupted by his surrounding circumstances; as a result of this, he is no longer what he used to be. Although she tries to remind him of the memorable moment of their youth, the concierge goes into a panic because he regards her offer as a sort of blackmail. She suddenly realizes that the incident upon the mountain had been one of the great moments of her life; in other words, "the eternal remembrance of the vision had made life seem enduring and good" (*Selected Stories* 186). However, at this moment, her eternal moment becomes ambivalent.

For the moment, let us look closely at Miss Raby's novel and Vorta's transformation. By a strange fate, Miss Raby's first novel, 'The Eternal Moment,' made a great sensation, "especially in unimaginative circles" (171). The novel was read and interpreted variously; consequently, it brought some British people to Vorta.

That very year Lady Anstey, Mrs Heriot, the Marquis of Bamburgh, and many others, penetrated to Vorta, where the scene of the book was laid. They returned enthusiastic. Lady Anstey exhibited her water-colour drawings; Mrs Heriot, who photographed, wrote an article in *The Strand*; while *The Nine-teenth Century* published a long description of the place by the Marquis of Bamburgh, entitled 'The Modern Peasant and his Relations with Roman Catholicism'.

Thanks to these efforts, Vorta became a rising place, and people who

liked being off the beaten track went there, and pointed out the way to others. (171)

The purpose of this long quotation is to show how images and expectations created through novels, newspapers, pictures and photographs are important to induce people to go on a trip. Ironically, Miss Raby's novel itself has been consumed as a marker of Vorta's landscape. The extract also tells us that Vorta used to be a favorite spot for anti-tourists. This reminds us of Monteriano, the setting of *Where Angels Fear to Tread*. The reason why Miss Raby did not return to Vorta for a long time is that she heard that an inferior class of tourist was finding it out and she feared to find something spoilt there, with the development of Vorta. The more popular Volta became, the less she wanted to go there.

Now, Miss Raby returns to Vorta with her maid (Elizabeth) and Colonel Leyland. When her party approaches the town, Miss Raby soon notices all of Vorta is extensively developed. She sees a lot of large glittering hotels:

*Pension Belle Vue* started out against a pinewood, and from the brink of the river the *Hotel de Londres* replied. *Pensions Liebig* and *Lorelei* were announced in green and amber respectively. The *Old-England* appeared in scarlet. The illuminations covered a large area, for the best hotels stood outside the village, in elevated or romantic situations. This display took place every evening in the season, but only while the diligence arrived. As soon as the last tourist was suited, the lights went out, and the hotel-keepers, cursing or rejoicing, retired to their cigars. (166)

She only says, "Horrible!" (166), for she finds that Vorta has been so sadly altered. Here, we notice that tourism spurs modernization.

At first, she and her companions go to the *Grand Hôtel des Alpes* because she believes that this hotel is owned by her old friend, the proprietress of the *Biscione*.

But, in the *Grand Hotel des Alpes*, one of the waiters who speaks "cosmopolitan English" (167) tells her that this hotel is owned by her old friend's son, adding that "[o]nly poor tourists go to the *Biscione*" (167). Workers in hotels classify their guests according to their birth. After Miss Raby says, "I shall not want my room" (168), she asks the well trained waiter to take her luggage to the *Biscione* immediately. He replies, 'Certainly!', adding that "[y]ou will have to pay" (168), therefore Miss Raby pays for the hotel though she did not either sleep or eat there. Then Forster describes this situation: "The elaborate machinery which had so recently sucked her in began to disgorge her. The trunks were carried down, the vehicle in which she had arrived was recalled" (168). Here we can see that the people in this town try to take advantage of the tourist trade as much as possible; therefore, they completely lost their old, peasant, warm simplicity and, in turn, they became the running dogs of capitalism. Forster also writes, "The whole population was employed, even down to the little girls, who worried the guests to buy picture postcards and edelweiss" (176). Vorta's transformation displeases Miss Raby:

She was not enthusiastic over the progress of civilization, knowing by Eastern experiences that civilization rarely puts her best foot foremost, and is apt to make the barbarians immoral and vicious before her compensating qualities arrive. And here there was no question of progress: the world had more to learn from the village than the village from the world. (172)

Forster's skeptical belief about civilization is definitely reflected in this passage.

In the *Biscione*, Miss Raby finds little changed but she feels "the pathos of a survival" (172). The owner of the *Biscione* sorrowfully tells Miss Raby that her son, her son's wife and her son's concierge try to ruin her. Then, Miss Raby is informed that the concierge is Feo.

Back to the *Grand Hôtel des Alpes* again, she recognizes the concierge (Feo) who seems to handle all languages. While she observes his performance of his duty



and she also sees that Feo makes a visitor buy more things than he wanted, she thinks as follows: “Intercourse with the gentle classes had required new qualities—civility, omniscience, imperturbability. It was the old answer: the gentle classes were responsible for him” (182). And Miss Raby reckons that “[h]e was one of the products of ‘The Eternal Moment’” (183). Trilling interprets Vorta’s transformation as follows:

The old warm simplicity had chilled into the swank and the aggression of class—of money-class and of snobbery, the eternal vice which so particularly marks the “modern” era of any civilization, the vice which Forster was to find even in India. (40)

Even though Miss Raby says that “I have done so much harm in Vorta,” Feo replies: “After the lady’s book, foreigners come, hotels are built, we all grow richer. When I first came here, I was a common ignorant porter who carried luggage over the passes; I worked, I found opportunities, I was pleasing to the visitors—and now!” (188). On the one hand, some individuals can benefit from tourism industry like Feo; on the other hand, others became poor and miserable like the *Biscione*’s owner. The contrast between Feo and the *Biscione*’s owner implies the cleavage in society between rich and poor caused by the tourism trade.

Another notable feature of this story is that Forster critically depicts not only British tourists but also foreign visitors such as Americans, Russians and Germans. For example, one of the American tourists suffers insomnia because of campaniles (a bell every morning at six), so he stops the early bell ringing. Miss Raby gets angry with him. Let us consider the following conversation. It begins with the American man explaining why he stops the bell.

He replied that he had come up all these feet for rest, and that if he did not get it he would move on to another centre. The English and American visitors had co-operated, and forced the hotel-keepers to take

action. Now the priests rang a dinner bell, which was endurable. He believed that 'cooperation' would do anything: it had been the same with the peasants.

'How did the tourists interfere with the peasants?' asked Miss Raby, getting very hot and trembling all over.

'We said the same; we had come for rest, and we would have it. Every week they got drunk and sang till two. Is that a proper way to go on, anyhow?' (174)

The American man emphasizes the reason that "we had come for rest" twice. This scene invites us to think about tourists' arrogant behavior toward the local traditional customs or life. This scene may present the discrepancy between tourist-sending countries and tourist-receiving countries. Forster thus raises the question of the relationship between tourists and locals (guests and hosts). Miss Raby is fully conscious of "the indefinable corruption which is produced by the passage of a large number of people" (175) and also conscious of "universal misdoing" (176).

In this story, tourism is presented as a major destroyer of local places where people lived in harmony with nature. We can read this story as a parable about the destructive power of modern tourism. Seen from a different perspective, we should not forget that Miss Raby's anti-touristic desires to avoid a crowded tourist destination and see unspoiled places are an impelling mechanism which brought about tourism on a global scale in the 20<sup>th</sup> century. The tourist industry, such as Thomas Cook & Son,<sup>5</sup> has expanded by catering to the client needs of different classes and different motivations.

## Conclusion

After we read "The Eternal Moment," we may understand that, in Forster's

---

<sup>5</sup> See Piers Bredon for a full account of Thomas Cook & Son.

novels, locations are extremely important. In the case of *Where Angels Fear to Tread*, the main reason why Forster was able to create a primitive character like Gino who is “a part of Nature”(WAFT 102) is that Monteriano is not spoiled by tourist industries. That is why Gino must live not in Florence but in Monteriano, a provincial Italian town. As Ruth Padel writes, the title of this novel (i.e. *Where Angels Fear to Tread*) was suggested by Forster’s publisher although Forster wanted to choose *Monteriano* as the title of this novel (xi-xii). It shows Forster’s special commitment to the location of the novel. Though Colmer regards Philip’s anti-touristic advice in the first paragraph of this novel simply as “irony” (56), this irony definitely plays a key role in leading his characters to Monteriano. But, the primitiveness of Monteriano and Gino will be threatened by modern tourism as is Vorta in “The Eternal Moment.” In contrast, in *A Room with a View*, Florence is such a popular tourist destination among British people. Therefore, Lucy can meet the Emersons, lower-middle-class tourists who were brought by modern democratizing tourism. Even though Forster grasped the meaning of tourism as an occasion for gaining a new concept of life, he expressed deep concern about destructive power of tourism.

### Works Cited

- Ardis, Ann. “Hellenism and the lure of Italy.” *The Cambridge Companion to E. M. Forster*. David Bradshaw, ed. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2007. 62-76.
- Brendon, Piers. *Thomas Cook: 150 Years of Popular Tourism*. London: Secker, 1992.
- Buzard, James. *The Beaten Track: European Tourism, Literature, and the Ways to Culture, 1800-1918*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1993.
- Colmer, John. *E. M. Forster: the Personal Voice*. London: Routledge, 1975.
- Crews, Frederic C. *E. M. Forster: The Perils of Humanism*. Princeton: Princeton UP, 1962.
- Forster, E. M. *Where Angels Fear to Tread*. Ed. Olver Stallybrass. London: Penguin, 2007.

- . "The Eternal Moment." *Selected Stories*. Ed. David Leavitt and Mark Mitchell. NY: Penguin, 2007.
- Lago, Mary. *E. M. Forster: A Literary Life*. Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1995.
- Lavin, Audrey A. P. *Aspects of the Novelist: E. M. Forster's Pattern and Rhythm*. NY: Peter, 1995.
- Otani, Erika. "Tourism, Anti-Tourism, and Communitas: E. M. Forster's Representation of Modern Tourism in *A Room with a View*." *Kyushu University English Review* 54 (2012): 17-39.
- Padel, Ruth. Introduction. *Where Angels Fear to Tread*. By E. M. Forster. London: Penguin, 2007. ix-xx.
- Pemble, John. *The Mediterranean Passion: Victorians and Edwardians in the South*. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1987.
- Peppls, Paul. "Forster and England." *The Cambridge Companion to E.M. Forster*. David Bradshaw, ed. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2007. 47-61.
- Royle, Nicholas. *E. M. Forster*. Plymouth: Northcote, 1999.
- Stevenson, Randall. "Forster and Modernism." *The Cambridge Companion to E. M. Forster*. David Bradshaw, ed. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2007. 209-222.
- Stone, Wilfred. *The Caves and the Mountain*. California: Stanford Up, 1966.
- Trilling, Lionel. *E. M. Forster*. London: Hogarth, 1959.
- Turner, Victor. *Dreams, Fields and Metaphors: Symbolic Action in Human Society*. NY: Cornell UP, 1974.
- Urry, John. *The Tourist Gaze: Leisure and Travel in Contemporary Societies*. London: Sage, 1990.